

Essay Evaluation Checklist for HUM199H Who Shot JFK? The Illusion and Reality of Evidence
 Innis College, University of Toronto

Student _____ Assignment _____

Evaluator _____ Date _____

Evaluation Criteria	Specific Comments/Examples
<p>Relevance of Response to the Topic (Focus): This essay</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> responds innovatively to the topic, resembling graduate level work <input type="checkbox"/> responds precisely and perceptively to the topic <input type="checkbox"/> responds appropriately, comprehensively, and competently to the topic <input type="checkbox"/> responds generally to the topic, addressing some aspects more effectively than others <input type="checkbox"/> responds incompletely and/or simplistically to the topic, or distorts the topic, thereby demonstrating a weak understanding of the topic, <input type="checkbox"/> responds inappropriately or tangentially to the topic, perhaps indicating a complete lack of understanding of the topic 	
<p>Quality of Thought and Research in Response to the Topic: This essay</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits original thinking and advanced conceptualization skills based on a critical analysis of both primary and secondary research <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits clarity, complexity, and depth of thought about the topic based on outstanding secondary research (and perhaps some primary) <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits clarity and some depth of thought about the topic based on competent research <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits some clarity, although only minimal depth, of thought about the topic, reflecting adequate but less than thorough research <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits faulty, stereotypical, or superficial thinking about the topic, reflecting insufficient or inadequate research <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits little or no evidence of effective thinking about the topic, reflecting inadequate or no research 	
<p>Organization and Development of the Response to the Topic: This essay</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits command of organization and a unique approach to the topic <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits command of organization and interesting development of the topic <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits control of organization and development of the topic <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits some control of organization (structure may be formulaic, may occasionally wander, or may be disrupted by weak transitions between points or paragraphs) and development (may contain some irrelevant or poorly chosen information) of the topic <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits insufficient control of organization (may ramble, may be repetitious, or may adhere to a simplistic formula) and development (may be mostly descriptive or may lack information) of the topic <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits limited or no sense of organization and/or contains little or no real substance (ideas are undeveloped, illogical, inconsistent, or based on inaccurate information) about the topic 	

<p>Quality of Expression and Style in Response to the Topic: This essay</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits extraordinary clarity, conciseness, and correctness in expression (word choice, usage, tone, sentence structure, and sentence sense) and style (spelling, grammar, punctuation, and mechanics) <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits command of expression and style with emphasis on correctness <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits control of expression and style, committing relatively few errors <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits sufficient control of expression and style, committing errors that do not interfere with understanding <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits a lack of control of expression and style, committing errors that interfere with understanding <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits serious and recurring errors in expression and/or style that prevent understanding 	
<p>Quality of Documentation and Manuscript Form: This essay</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits mastery of documentation and manuscript form by adhering meticulously to a designated (preferably by the instructor) format (such as MLA, CMS, or APA) in a manner that enhances the analysis <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits command of documentation and manuscript form by adhering consistently and precisely to a designated format <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits control of documentation and manuscript form by adhering mostly (with only minor inconsistency and imprecision) to a designated format <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits some control of documentation and/or manuscript form by demonstrating a basic awareness of the designated format but lacking in consistency and precision <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits lack of control of documentation and manuscript form by failing to adhere to a designated format (mixes different formats or fabricates own format) <input type="checkbox"/> exhibits little understanding or appreciation of documentation (references are insufficient or missing) and manuscript form (difficult to read or unprofessional) 	

Overall Evaluation:

Excellent	Good	Adequate	Marginal	Failure
A+___ A___ A-___	B+___ B___ B-___	C+___ C___ C-___	D+___ D___ D-___	F___

Final Remarks and Recommendations for Improvement: